

**UNITED STATES JUDICIAL PANEL
on
MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION**

**IN RE: C.R. BARD, INC., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION**

MDL No. 2187

TRANSFER ORDER

Before the Panel: Plaintiff in the action listed on Schedule A (*Hudspeth*) moves under Panel Rule 7.1 to vacate our order conditionally transferring the action to MDL No. 2187. Responding defendants Ethicon, Inc. and Johnson & Johnson (collectively, Ethicon) oppose the motion to vacate.

After considering the argument of counsel, we find this action involves common questions of fact with the actions previously transferred to MDL No. 2187, and that transfer under 28 U.S.C. § 1407 will serve the convenience of the parties and witnesses and promote the just and efficient conduct of the litigation. Plaintiff does not dispute that her action shares questions of fact with MDL No. 2187. Like many of the already-centralized actions, *Hudspeth* involves factual questions arising from allegations that C.R. Bard, Inc. and related entities defectively designed, manufactured, and marketed pelvic surgical mesh products, resulting in serious injuries, and that defendants failed to provide appropriate warnings and instructions regarding the risks and dangers posed by the devices. *See In re: Avaulta Pelvic Support Sys. Prods. Liab. Litig.*, 746 F. Supp. 2d 1362 (J.P.M.L. 2010); Order Renaming Litigation, MDL No. 2187 (J.P.M.L. Feb. 13, 2012).


In support of the motion to vacate, plaintiff argues that the transferor court should be allowed to rule on the pending motion to remand to state court. The Panel often has held that jurisdictional issues do not present an impediment to transfer, as plaintiffs can present these arguments to the transferee judge.¹ *See, e.g., In re Prudential Ins. Co. of Am. Sales Practices Litig.*, 170 F. Supp. 2d 1346, 1347-48 (J.P.M.L. 2001).

¹ Moreover, under Panel Rule 2.1(d), the pendency of a conditional transfer order does not limit the pretrial jurisdiction of the court in which the subject action is pending. Between the date a remand motion is filed and the date that transfer of the action to the MDL is finalized, a court generally has adequate time to rule on a remand motion if it chooses to do so.

-2-

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the action listed on Schedule A is transferred to the Southern District of West Virginia and, with the consent of that court, assigned to the Honorable Joseph R. Goodwin for inclusion in the coordinated or consolidated pretrial proceedings.

PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Sarah S. Vance", positioned above a horizontal line.

Sarah S. Vance
Chair

Marjorie O. Rendell
Lewis A. Kaplan
R. David Proctor

Charles R. Breyer
Ellen Segal Huvelle
Catherine D. Perry

**IN RE: C.R. BARD, INC., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION**

MDL No. 2187

SCHEDULE A

Middle District of Florida

HUDSPETH v. C.R. BARD, INC., ET AL., C.A. No. 3:14-01465



Activity in Case MDL No. 2187 IN RE: C.R. Bard, Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products Liability Litigation Existing Transfer Order (Transferee Court)

JPMLCMECF

to:

JPMLCMDECF

04/01/2015 03:09 PM

Hide Details

From: JPMLCMECF@jpml.uscourts.gov

To: JPMLCMDECF@jpml.uscourts.gov

This is an automatic e-mail message generated by the CM/ECF system. Please DO NOT RESPOND to this e-mail because the mail box is unattended.

United States

United States Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation

Notice of Electronic Filing

The following transaction was entered on 4/1/2015 at 3:08 PM EDT and filed on 4/1/2015

Case Name: IN RE: C.R. Bard, Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products Liability Litigation

Case Number: [MDL No. 2187](#)

Filer:

Document Number: No document attached

Docket Text:

*****TEXT ONLY ENTRY*****

MINUTE ORDER -- TO TRANSFeree CLERK: ACTION REQUIRED

A transfer order has been filed today in this litigation. The order is directed to your court for filing. Rule 2.1 of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, states...An order to transfer or remand pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1407 shall be effective only upon its filing with the clerk of the transferee district court.

Signed by Clerk of the Panel Jeffery N. Luthi on 4/1/2015.

Associated Cases: MDL No. 2187, FLM/3:14-cv-01465 (dn)**Case Name:** Hudspeth v. C.R. Bard, Inc. et al**Case Number:** [FLM/3:14-cv-01465](#)**Filer:****Document Number:** No document attached**Docket Text:*******TEXT ONLY ENTRY*******MINUTE ORDER -- TO TRANSFEREE CLERK: ACTION REQUIRED**

A transfer order has been filed today in this litigation. The order is directed to your court for filing. Rule 2.1 of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, states...An order to transfer or remand pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1407 shall be effective only upon its filing with the clerk of the transferee district court.

Signed by Clerk of the Panel Jeffery N. Luthi on 4/1/2015.

Associated Cases: MDL No. 2187, FLM/3:14-cv-01465 (dn)

No public notice (electronic or otherwise) sent because the entry is private



Activity in Case MDL No. 2187 IN RE: C.R. Bard, Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products
Liability Litigation Transfer Order

JPMLCMECF

to:

JPMLCMDECF

04/01/2015 03:09 PM

Hide Details

From: JPMLCMECF@jpml.uscourts.gov

To: JPMLCMDECF@jpml.uscourts.gov

This is an automatic e-mail message generated by the CM/ECF system. Please DO NOT RESPOND to this e-mail because the mail box is unattended.

*****NOTE TO PUBLIC ACCESS USERS***** Judicial Conference of the United States policy permits attorneys of record and parties in a case (including pro se litigants) to receive one free electronic copy of all documents filed electronically, if receipt is required by law or directed by the filer. PACER access fees apply to all other users. To avoid later charges, download a copy of each document during this first viewing. However, if the referenced document is a transcript, the free copy and 30 page limit do not apply.

United States

United States Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation

Notice of Electronic Filing

The following transaction was entered on 4/1/2015 at 3:07 PM EDT and filed on 4/1/2015

Case Name: IN RE: C.R. Bard, Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products Liability Litigation

Case Number: [MDL No. 2187](#)

Filer:

Document Number: [1163](#)

Docket Text:

TRANSFER ORDER re: pldg. (9 in FLM/3:14-cv-01465, [1124] in MDL No. 2187), (14 in FLM/3:14-cv-01465, [1141] in MDL No. 2187)

Transferring 1 action(s) - MDL No. 2187, FLM/3:14-cv-01465

Signed by Judge Sarah S. Vance, Chair, PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION, on 4/1/2015.

Associated Cases: MDL No. 2187, FLM/3:14-cv-01465 (dn)

Case Name: Hudspeth v. C.R. Bard, Inc. et al

Case Number: [FLM/3:14-cv-01465](#)

Filer:

Document Number: [15](#)

Docket Text:

TRANSFER ORDER re: pldg. (9 in FLM/3:14-cv-01465, [1124] in MDL No. 2187), (14 in FLM/3:14-cv-01465, [1141] in MDL No. 2187)

Transferring 1 action(s) - MDL No. 2187, FLM/3:14-cv-01465

Signed by Judge Sarah S. Vance, Chair, PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION, on 4/1/2015.

Associated Cases: MDL No. 2187, FLM/3:14-cv-01465 (dn)

MDL No. 2187 Notice has been electronically mailed to:

Carl N Frankovitch carl@facslaw.com, terry@facslaw.com

Michael J Farrell mjf@farrell3.com

Harry F. Bell, Jr hfbell@belllaw.com, camclain@belllaw.com

Paul T. Farrell, Jr paul@greeneketchum.com, lora@greeneketchum.com

Marc E. Williams marc.williams@nelsonmullins.com

MDL No. 2187 Notice will not be electronically mailed to:

FLM/3:14-cv-01465 Notice has been electronically mailed to:

Richard B. North, Jr richard.north@nelsonmullins.com, Andrew.Rosenzweig@nelsonmullins.com, mandy.evangelista@nelsonmullins.com, maria.turner@nelsonmullins.com

Patricia E. Lowry patricia.lowry@squirepb.com

Christy D. Jones christy.jones@butlersnow.com, ashley.lampkin@butlersnow.com, brandy.pitts@butlersnow.com, catherine.mason@butlersnow.com, ecf.notices@butlersnow.com, krcrawford@riker.com, mkabbash@riker.com

Lori Gail Cohen cohenl@gtlaw.com, melvillee@gtlaw.com, paged@gtlaw.com

Scott William Anderson sanderson@shb.com

Gregory A Anderson gaanderson@asglaw.com

Charles S. Siegel siegel@waterskraus.com, khewlett@waterskraus.com

Micah L Hobbs mhobbs@shb.com

Chris McRae cmcrae@shb.com

Devin Kyle Ross dkross@shb.com, ckirk@shb.com

Andrew R. Kruppa andrew.kruppa@squirepb.com

James G. T. Nealis, IV jnealis@asglaw.com

Justin Benjamin Aronson aronsonj@gtlaw.com

FLM/3:14-cv-01465 Notice will not be electronically mailed to:

The following document(s) are associated with this transaction:

Document description:Main Document

Original filename:n/a

Electronic document Stamp:

[STAMP JPMLStamp_ID=1090522767 [Date=4/1/2015] [FileNumber=544967-0] [9f55a08158d6a751a6e2e32f13cef12b1b89c8d4797cfb44616d5626faf78be6975bf28b9279c9317abe87ddaab835ee17d8550a31229adddd213e3159152db4]]